



The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Syllabus

Ancient Monuments and Places of Memory - Between Science Orientalism Translocation and Restitution - 39947

Last update 28-02-2021

HU Credits: 4

Degree/Cycle: 2nd degree (Master)

Responsible Department: History

Academic year: 2021

Semester: 2nd Semester

Teaching Languages: Hebrew

Campus: Mt. Scopus

Course/Module Coordinator: Dr. Matthias Schmidt

Coordinator Email: matthias.schmidt@mail.huji.ac.il

Coordinator Office Hours: by appointment only

Teaching Staff:

Dr. Matthias Schmidt

Course/Module description:

The development of archaeology as a scientific discipline in 19th century Europe and the rising general interest in the "Orient" led to the new phenomenon of private and official expeditions from all over Europe into the former territories of ancient empires and large scale excavations of ancient places and cities in the name of science. Most of the archaeological projects started in these decades served the enlargement of art collections in the museums of the European cities. The struggle for the possession of lucrative collections of ancient objects led to strong international competition between the respective states for exclusive excavation rights and spectacular findings from the ancient world which were translocated to European cities. The seminar will focus on prominent representative examples of seizure of cultural goods during colonialism, specific large-scale displacements and translocations as a result of a partition of excavation discoveries and research expeditions and on other displacements of ancient cultural assets from the Greek and Roman World as well as Mesopotamia and Egypt - like Troia, Mykene, Delphi, Athens, Pergamon, Tell Halaf, Uruk, Ninive, Babylon, Armana and the Valley of the Kings. The seminar will present these cases under several aspects: the description of the original character of the sites; their functionalization as places of memories over the centuries; the history of their excavations in context of the legal circumstances and processes of translocations; the documentation of displacement in contemporary media and art; the conceptual presentation and functionalization of the monuments in their new environments and the legal and political issues and questions of repatriation/restitution which have reached more universal momentum only towards the end of the 20th and the beginning of the 21st centuries in the context of the discourse about the role of European science, universities and museums in colonialism and imperialism. Each place will be presented in relation to the biographies of the protagonists/actors, their interaction and networking with relevant institutions of science and politics, their motivations and goals in a specific academic discourse as well as in regard to the traumas caused by these displacements to the original landscape and its populations.

Course/Module aims:

Students will get acquainted with prominent examples of archaeological excavations of Greek and Roman antiquities and other important heritage sites in the Eastern Mediterranean and Middle East in the 19th and early 20th century. They will study the motivations of the scientists and implementations of these excavations in their broader scientific, social, political and diplomatic contexts of international competition, imperialism and colonialism/orientalism and will learn about the legal and scientific controversies surrounding these enterprises till today.

Students will study these large scale-excavations and displacements in context of a broader public discourse as reflected in contemporary media throughout the decades. They will investigate the translocations of antiquities to central European museums and follow the different concepts of presenting the findings in a new “scientific” context creating “realms of memory” for developing new national identities in museums. They will learn to differentiate between art theft and spoliation conducted in times of war and occupation, seizure of cultural goods during colonialism and displacements as a result of a partition of excavation discoveries and research expeditions. Furthermore, students will experience the interdependence of different source materials (diaries, photography, artistic images, personal and diplomatic correspondences, legislation and contracts, official excavation reports, scientific publications or contemporary newspaper articles and artefacts) to reach a comprehensive understanding of the academic, diplomatic and legal processes involved in the dealing with the cultural heritage of antiquities. Students will understand how modern science and individual scientists worked under the influence and pressure of ideologies like nationalism serving aims of imperialism and colonialism. They will get acquainted with legislation to limit the translocations of cultural assets at the time and will study the current discourse about the role of European science and cultural institutions in colonialism, as well as the ongoing modern demands of various countries for return of these cultural assets. They will learn to present the political, legal, moral, ethical and scientific arguments in favour or against restitution and repatriation of antiquities to their land of origin to develop their own opinion on these matters.

Learning outcomes - On successful completion of this module, students should be able to:

- * understand the importance of memory and its manifestation in material monuments for the (re)construction of a social identity in past and present;*
- * analyze and understand the interplay of individual researchers and science, international politics and competition, national identities and collective memory in the contexts of imperialism and orientalism based on primary sources (documents) and relevant literature;*
- * understand the involvement of science, academic institutions and museums in colonialism and imperialism;*
- * characterize historical museums, archaeological exhibitions and parks as “places of memory” and evaluate the elements of the collective memory for the conception and design of such museums;*
- * assess the dynamics and problems of translocations/displacement for the local topographies and populations;*
- * develop an awareness for the questions of restitution and repatriation of cultural assets in post-colonial times;*
- * localize symbolic elements of the memorial heritage of communities;*
- * select and synthesize material from lectures and recommended primary and secondary sources as well as research literature to use in oral and written*

discussions of set topics.

Attendance requirements(%):

95

Teaching arrangement and method of instruction: Reading, analysis and interpretation of different primary sources: diaries, photography, artistic images, personal and diplomatic correspondences, legislation and contracts, official excavation reports, scientific publications or contemporary newspaper articles, and visual material and artefacts; presentation and discussion of research literature; preliminary readings for each session will be circulated and must be prepared in advance. In the seminar, lectures, power point presentations, class room discussions, group work and student presentations will alternate.

Course/Module Content:

The following schedule gives the topics of the main sessions of the seminar (without sub-sections). A more detailed work plan will be published on moodle step by step during the term.

1. Introduction

1.1 Definitions - Questions - Sources - Methodology - Approaches - Examples

2. Lawyers, Collectors, Explorers, and Diplomats - Social, Political and Cultural Backgrounds

2.1 Marcus Cicero against Gaius Verres: The Trial about Looted Art - A Test Case for Restitution today?

2.2 Johann Joachim Winckelmann: The German Superintendent of Roman Antiquities

2.3 Ludwig I of Bavaria: The Glyptothek in Munich and the idea of a "German Athens"

2.3 James Simon: Entrepreneur, Art Collector and Patron of the Arts during the Wilhelmine Period

2.4 Gertrude Bell: Mapping of the Middle East for Archaeology and British Imperial Policy

3. The Archaeologists - Between Memory and Identity, Excavation and Displacement

3.1 Heinrich Schliemann: Troia and Mykene - the Search for the "City and Treasures of Priamos"

3.2 Lord Elgin - The Athenian Acropolis and the Parthenon Frieze - From Athens to London

3.3 Théophile Homolle: The Greek village of Delphi - a special case?

3.4 Carl Humann, Wilhelm Dörpfeld and Kaiser Wilhelm II.: The Pergamon Altar as a

National Project

3.5 Robert Koldewey: *Babylon-Berlin - Between Science, Theology, Institutionalism and National Pride*

3.6 Max von Oppenheim: *Tell Halaf and the "Revolutionizing the Islamic territories of our enemies"*

3.7 *The Looting of Egypt - Temples, Tombs, Obelisks and Sculptures for Berlin, Paris, London, New York*

4. *Displacements and Repatriation/Restitution - Historical Developments, Current Tendencies and Approaches*

4.1 *The Iconography of Displacements/Translocations - Reactions in the contemporary media and arts*

4.2 *Osman Hamdi Bey and the Protection of Antiquities in the Ottoman Empire*

Required Reading:

The following items are considered as basic introductory reading into general aspects of the subject matter. All participants should familiarize themselves in advance with these items which are all posted on the moodle.page of the course or are available online. - More required reading (documents, articles, book chapters) will be determined in relation to the specific subjects of the course and will be posted in due time on the moodle.page in chronological order according to the sessions of the seminar.

*James Cuno, *Who Owns Antiquity? Museums and the Battle over Our Ancient Heritage*, Princeton University Press: Princeton, 2011 (online access HUJI Library).

*James Cuno, "Culture War: The Case against Repatriating Museum Artifacts", in: *Foreign Affairs* 93.6 (Nov/Dec 2014), 119/124, 126-129 (on moodle).

*Derek Fincham, "The Parthenon Sculptures and Cultural Justice", in: *Fordham Intellectual Property, Media & Entertainment Journal* 23 (2013), 943-1016 (on moodle).

*Don D. Fowler, "The Uses of the Past: Archaeology in the Service of the State", in: *American Antiquity* 52 (1987), 229-248 (on moodle).

*David Gill, Christopher Chippindale, "From Boston to Rome: Reflections on Returning Antiquities", in: *International Journal of Cultural Property* (2006), 13:311-331; on moodle and also available at >
<https://plone.unige.ch/art-adr/cases-affaires/13-antiquities-2013-italy-and-boston-museum-of-fine-arts-1/gill-and-chippindale-from-boston-to-rome-returning-antiquities/view>

*Kent Greenawalt, "Thinking in terms of law and morality", in: *International Journal of Cultural Property* 7.1 (1998), 7-20 (on moodle).

*Sarah Irving, S. (2013), "The Restitution of Ancient Artefacts", in: *Reinvention: an International Journal of Undergraduate Research*, BCUR/ICUR 2013 Special Issue, available at >
<http://www.warwick.ac.uk/reinventionjournal/archive/bcur2013specialissue/irving/>

*John Henry Merryman, "Cultural Property Ethics", in: *International Journal of Cultural Property* 7.2 (1998), 21-31 (on moodle).

*Roger O'Keefe, "From the high Renaissance to the Hague Rules", in: *idem, The Protection of Cultural Property in Armed Conflict*, Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2006. 5-34 (chap. 1) (on moodle).

*Lyndel V. Prott, Patrick J. O'Keefe, "'Cultural Heritage' or 'Cultural Property'?", in: *International Journal of Cultural Property* 2 (1992), 307-320 (on moodle).

*Ann P. Prunty, "Toward Establishing an International Tribunal for the Settlement of Cultural Property Disputes: How to Keep Greece from Losing its Marbles", in: *Georgetown L. J.* 72 (1983-84), 1155-1182 (on moodle).

*Felwine Sarr, Bénédicte Savoy, *The Restitution of African Cultural Heritage. Towards a New Relational Ethics*, November 2018; on moodle and also available at >
<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1jetudXp3vued-yA8gvRwGjH6QLOfss4-/view>

*Janna Thompson, "Cultural Property, Restitution and Value", in: *Journal of Applied Philosophy* 20.3 (2003), 251-262 (on moodle).

Additional Reading Material:

The titles below are considered as additional reading. They include comprehensive introductions to different or general aspects of our subject, monographs on certain issues and problems, but also some specific publications on different issues, which might give perspectives beyond the discussion in class. If necessary - some sections of these items will become obligatory reading during the course and then posted on the moodle.page.

Zainab Bahrani, "Conjuring Mesopotamia. Imaginative geography and a world past", in: Lynn Meskell (ed.) *Archaeology Under Fire. Nationalism, politics and heritage in the Eastern Mediterranean and Middle East*, London New York: Routledge 1998, 159-174 (downloaded).

Can Bilsel, *Antiquity on Display: Regimes of the Authentic in Berlin's Pergamon Museum*, Oxford University Press: Oxford 2012 (online access HUJI library).

Mary Bouquet, *Museums. A Visual Anthropology*, Berg: London, New York, 2012 (GN 35 B68 2012 (GN 35 B68 2012)

Dan Brown, "Restitution of Artifacts: A Colonial Obligation?", in: *The Cambridge Global Affair*>

<https://www.thecambridgeglobalaffair.co.uk/our-articles/restitution-of-cultural-artifacts>

Mirjam Brusius, "The Field in the Museum: Puzzling Out Babylon in Berlin", in: *OSIRIS* 32 (2017), 264-285 (downloaded).

Nayan Chanda, *Bound Together: How Traders, Preachers, Adventures, and Warriors Shaped Globalization*, Yale University Press: New Haven, Conn., 2007 (online HUJI Library).

Annie E. Coombes, *Reinventing Africa: Museums, Material Culture, and Popular Imagination in Late Victorian and Edwardian England*, Yale University Press: New Haven, 1994 (DT 32 C66).

Lisa Cooper, *In Search of Kings and Conquerors: Gertrude Bell and the Archaeology of the Middle East*, I.B. Tauris: London, New York, 2016 (online access HUJI Library).

Martina D'Alton, *The New York Obelisk, or: How Cleopatra's Needle Came to New York and what Happened When It Got Here*, Metropolitan Museum of Art/Abrams: New York, 1993.

James Ede, "Ethics, the antiquities trade, and archaeology", in: *International Journal of Cultural Property* 7.1 (1998), 128-131 (downloaded).

Talia Einhorn, "Restitution of Archaeological Artifacts: The Arab-Israeli Aspect", in: *IJCP* 5 (1996), S. 133-153 (downloaded).

Kate Fitz Gibbon (ed.), *Who Owns the Past? Cultural Policy, Cultural Property, and the Law*, Rutgers University Press: New Brunswick, N.J., 2005 (K 487 C8 W48 2005).

David Gill, "Looting Matters for Classical Antiquities: Contemporary Issues in Archaeological Ethics", in: *Present Pasts* 1 (2009), 77-104 (downloaded).

Klaus Goldmann, *The Trojan Treasures in Berlin: The Disappearance and Search for the Objects after World War II*, in: Elizabeth Simpson (Hrsg.), *The Spoils of War, World War II and Its Aftermath: The Loss, Reappearance, and Recovery of Cultural Property*, New York 1997, 200-203.

Karl Goldmann, "The Treasure of the Berlin State Museums and Its Allied Capture: Remarks and Questions", in: *International Journal of Cultural Property* 7.2 (1998), 308-341 (downloaded).

James F. Goode, *Negotiating for the Past: Archaeology, Nationalism, and Diplomacy*

in the Middle East, 1919–1941, University of Texas Press: Austin, 2007 (DS 56 G66 2007).

Tristram Hunt, "Should Museums return their colonial artefacts?", in: *The Observer* 29 Jun 2019>

<https://www.theguardian.com/culture/2019/jun/29/should-museums-return-their-colonial-artefacts>

David Ilan, Yuval Gadot, "Undermining the Edifice of Ethnocentric Historical Narrative in Israel with Community-Based Archaeology", in: Eberhard W. Sauer, Bradley J. Parker, Ran Boytner, Lynn Swartz Dodd (eds), *Controlling the past, owning the future: the political uses of archaeology in the Middle East*, University of Arizona Press: Tucson, 2010, 103-122 (Overseas Library Open Shelf 930.1 B789).

Koen de Jager, "Claims to Cultural Property under International Law", in: *LJIL* 1 (1988), S. 183–197 (downloaded).

Tiffany Jenkins, *Keeping Their Marbles: how the treasures of the past ended up in museums – and why they should stay there*, Oxford University Press: Oxford, 2016.

Flora S. Kaplan (eds.), *Museums and the Making of "Ourselves": The Role of Objects in National Identity*, Leicester University Press: London, 1994 (N 410 M878 1996).

Ann E. Killebrew, "Who owns the past?: the role of nationalism, politics, and profit in presenting Israel's archaeological sites to the public", in: Eberhard W. Sauer, Bradley J. Parker, Ran Boytner, Lynn Swartz Dodd (eds), *Controlling the past, owning the future: the political uses of archaeology in the Middle East*, University of Arizona Press: Tucson, 2010, 123-141 (Overseas Library Open Shelf 930.1 B789).

Christa L. Kirby, "Stolen Cultural Property; Available Museum Responses to an international Dilemma", in: *Dickinson Law Review* 104 (2000), 729–748 (downloaded).

Raz Kletter, *Just Past? The Making of Israeli Archaeology*, Equinox: London, Oakville, CT, 2006 (online access HUJI Library).

Philip L. Kohl, Clare Fawcett, "Archaeology in the service of the state: theoretical considerations", in: Philip L. Kohl, Clare Fawcett (eds), *Nationalism, politics and the practice of archaeology*, Cambridge, UK, 1995 (reprint 2000), 3-18 (downloaded).

Wojciech W. Kowalski, "Repatriation of cultural property following a cession of territory or dissolution of multinational states", in: *AAL* 2001, 139–166 (downloaded).

John Henry Merryman, *Thinking about the Elgin Marbles: Critical Essays on Cultural Property, Art and Law*, The Hague, London, Boston 2000. (Mount Scopus Law Library - Middle Level General 351.853/MER)

John Henry Merryman (ed.), *Imperialism, Art and Restitution*, Cambridge University

Press: Cambridge, 2006 (Law Library Middle Level General 351.853(100)/IMP).
John Henry Merryman, Albert E. Elsen, *Law, Ethics and the Visual Arts*, London, 1998. (Mount Scopus Law Library - Middle Level General 340.7(73)/MER)

Anneliese Monden, Geert Wils, "Art Objects as Common Heritage of Mankind", in: *Revue Belge de Droit International* 19 (1986), 327-338.

Oscar White Muscarella, "The Fifth Column within the Archaeological Realm: The Great Divide", in: *idem.*, *Archaeology, artifacts and antiquities in the ancient Near East: sites, cultures, and proveniences*, Brill: Leiden, 2013, chap. 31, 861-876.

Oscar White Muscarella, "The Antiquities Trade and the Destruction of Ancients Near Eastern Cultures", in: *idem.*, *Archaeology, artifacts and antiquities in the ancient Near East: sites, cultures, and proveniences*, Brill: Leiden, 2013. chap. 30, 838-860.

Roger O'Keefe, "Other relevant bodies of law", in: *idem.*, *The Protection of Cultural Property in Armed Conflict*, Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2006, 302-359 (chap. 6) (downloaded).

Ida Ostenberg, *Staging the World: Spoils, Captives, and Representations in the Roman Triumphal Procession*, Oxford University Press: Oxford, 2009 - online access HUJI Library).

Mehmet Öydoğan, "Ideology and archaeology in Turkey", in: Lynn Meskell (ed.) *Archaeology Under Fire. Nationalism, politics and heritage in the Eastern Mediterranean and Middle East*, London New York: Routledge 1998, 111-123 (downloaded).

Donald Malcolm Reid, *Whose Pharaohs? Archaeology, Museums, and Egyptian National Identity from Napoleon to World War I*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002 (online access HUJI Library).

Christian Rumpf, „Wem gehört der Pergamon-Altar?“, in: *ZfTS* 6 (1993), 287-294 (downloaded).

Eberhard W. Sauer, Bradley J. Parker, Ran Boytner, Lynn Swartz Dodd (eds), *Controlling the past, owning the future: the political uses of archaeology in the Middle East*, University of Arizona Press: Tucson, 2010 (Overseas Library Open Shelf 930.1 B789)

Bénédicte Savoy, *Patrimoine annexé. Les biens culturels saisis par la France en Allemagne autour de 1800*, Éditions de la Maison des sciences de l'homme: Paris, 2003.

Ignaz Seidl-Hohenveldern, "Artefacts as National Cultural Heritage and as Common Heritage to Mankind", in: Emmanuel G. Bello, Bola A. Ajibola (eds.), *Essays in Honour of Judge Taslim Olawale Elias*, 2 vols., Martinus Nijhoff: Dordrecht, 1992),

vol. I, 163ff. (Law Library Lower Level International Law 341(08)/ELI).
Eric C. Schneider, "Plunder or Excavation? Observations and Suggestions on the Regulation of Ownership and Trade in the Evidence of Cultural Patrimony", in: *Syracuse Journal of International Law and Commerce* 9 (1982), 1-19 (downloaded).

Caroline Steele, "Who Has Not eaten Cherries With the Devil? Archaeology Under Challenge", in: Susan Pollock, Reinhard Bernbeck (eds.), *Archaeologies of the Middle East: Critical Perspectives*, Blackwell Publishing: Oxford, 2005, 45-65 (Archaeology Library Prehistory Collection PREH 3500.POL).

Bruce G. Trigger, "Romanticism, nationalism, and archaeology", in: Philip L. Kohl, Clare Fawcett (eds), *Nationalism, politics and the practice of archaeology*, Cambridge, UK, 1995 (reprint 2000), 263-279 (downloaded).

Rüdiger Wolfrum, "The Protection of Cultural Property in armed conflict", in: *Israel Yearbook on Human Rights* 32 (2003), 305-338 (reprinted in: *The Progression of International Law Four Decades of the Israel Yearbook on Human Rights - An Anniversary Volume*, 2011, 297-330; downloaded).

Sefa Yildirim, Fatih Öytop, "The Protection of Historical Artifacts in Ottoman Empire: The Permanent Council for the Protection of Ancient Artifacts", in: *Universal Journal of Educational Research* 7.2 (2019), 600-608 (downloaded).

Useful Links:

ArThemis, the open-access cultural property restitution database >

<https://en.unesco.org/news/arthemis-open-access-cultural-property-restitution-database>

Cases of ArThemis >

<https://plone.unige.ch/art-adr/cases-affaires>

Course/Module evaluation:

End of year written/oral examination 0 %

Presentation 0 %

Participation in Tutorials 5 %

Project work 90 %

Assignments 5 %

Reports 0 %

Research project 0 %

Quizzes 0 %

Other 0 %

Additional information: